

TECHNOLOGY & COSTS

Technoeconomics - Energy & Chemicals (TECH)

TECH 2019S12 Flow Batteries for Large-Scale Energy Storage

Table of ContentsA Report by **Nexant, Inc.**

Published Date: December 2019

www.nexantsubscriptions.com**Contents**

1	Executive Summary	1
1.1	Objective of the Report.....	1
1.2	Introduction.....	1
1.3	Roadmap for Large-Scale Energy Storage	3
1.4	Technologies and Applications	4
1.5	Market Assessment, Trends, and Outlook	4
1.6	Economics and Costs Analysis	5
1.7	Case Studies	6
1.8	Conclusion.....	7
2	Introduction.....	9
2.1	Objective.....	9
2.1.1	Structure of Report	9
2.1.2	Approach and Methodology	10
2.2	De-carbonization	11
2.2.1	Mitigating Climate Change	11
2.2.2	Role of Intermittent Energy Sources	11
2.3	Relevance of Energy Storage	12
2.3.1	Overview	12
2.3.2	Classification of Energy Storage	13
2.3.3	Maturity of Energy Storage Technologies	15
2.4	Battery Energy Storage Systems	16
2.4.1	Key Drivers	17
2.4.2	Importance of Flow Batteries	18
2.5	Outlook	19
2.5.1	Overview	19
2.5.2	Increased Role and Market Share	19
2.6	Undertaking Specific Large-Scale Energy Storage Projects.....	19
2.6.1	Module 1 - Developing a Project Plan for Energy Storage	20
2.6.2	Module 2 - Review of Key Pathways and Options	20

2.6.3	Module 3 - Competitor Assessment	20
2.6.4	Module 4 - Detailed Technology Screening	20
2.6.5	Module 5 - Detailed Patent Landscape Analysis	21
2.6.6	Module 6 - Other Project Specific Evaluations	21
2.7	Conclusions	21
3	Roadmap for Large-Scale Energy Storage	23
3.1	Emphasis on Sustainable Energy	23
3.2	Suitability of Large-Scale Energy Storage	23
3.3	Optimizing Energy Sources and Uses	24
3.4	Integrated Energy Assessment	25
3.5	Recommended Roadmap	25
3.6	Systems Approach	28
3.6.1	Technologies	28
3.6.2	End-Use Applications	29
3.7	Potential BESS Technology Impacts	30
3.8	Performance Criteria for BESS Technologies	31
3.9	Conclusions	32
4	Technologies and Applications	33
4.1	Overview of Energy Storage and Flow Batteries Technologies and Applications	33
4.2	Vanadium Redox Flow Batteries	40
4.2.1	Vanadium in Storage Batteries	40
4.2.2	Advantages of the VRB	40
4.2.3	How a VRB Works	40
4.2.4	Cost of Electrolyte	41
4.2.5	VFB Strengths and Weaknesses	43
4.2.6	Key Advancements in the VRB to Reduce Size and Cost	43
4.2.7	VFB Developers and Vendors	44
4.3	Zinc-based Flow Batteries	53
4.3.1	Overview of Zinc-based Flow Batteries	53
4.3.2	Vanadium-Zinc Flow Batteries	54
4.3.3	Zinc-Bromide Flow Batteries	55
4.3.4	Overview of Zinc-Bromide Batteries	55
4.3.5	How Zinc-Bromide Batteries Work	56
4.3.6	Practical Challenges of Zinc-Bromide Batteries	56
4.3.7	Zinc Bromide Battery Strengths and Weaknesses	57
4.3.8	Zinc Bromide Flow Battery Developers and Vendors	57
4.4	Iron-based flow Batteries	60
4.4.1	All-Iron Flow Batteries	60
4.4.2	Zinc-Vanadium (Zn-V) Hybrid Redox	61
4.4.3	Zinc-Cerium	61
4.4.4	Ferrocyanide Version of Iron Batteries	61
4.4.5	Iron-Chromium (ICB) Flow Battery	62
4.4.6	Polysulfide Bromide Flow Batteries	64
4.5	Sodium-ion Battery	64
4.5.1	Aquion Energy	64

4.6	Conclusions.....	66
5	Market Assessment, Trends, and Outlook	67
5.1	Historical and Current Trends	67
5.1.1	Overview	67
5.1.2	Macro Trends	67
5.1.3	Renewables Penetration and Declining Costs	67
5.1.4	Applications and Challenges.....	68
5.1.5	Integration with Electricity System	68
5.2	Energy Storage Markets.....	69
5.2.1	Overall Energy Storage Mix	69
5.2.2	Large-Scale Battery Energy Storage	71
5.2.3	Future Storage Growth Projections.....	74
5.3	Key Market Drivers and Dynamics.....	75
5.3.1	Electricity Sector.....	75
5.3.2	Energy Utilities Drivers	80
5.3.3	C&I Drivers	81
5.3.4	Residential Drivers	81
5.4	Influencing Market Factors	82
5.4.1	Ownership Segmentation.....	82
5.4.2	Competition for Large-Scale BESS.....	82
5.4.3	Incentives for Investments in BESS.....	83
5.4.4	Evaluation of Energy Storage Revenues	83
5.4.5	Evolving Business Models	84
5.4.6	Near-Term to Medium-Term Prospects	85
5.5	Risks.....	85
5.5.1	Legislative, Regulatory, and Political	85
5.5.2	Volume or Development Risk.....	86
5.6	Key Gaps.....	86
5.6.1	Overview	86
5.6.2	Evaluations and Assessments Required.....	86
5.7	Future Outlook.....	86
5.8	Conclusions.....	87
6	Costs and Techno-Economics	88
6.1	The Meaning of These Analyses.....	88
6.1.1	Overview	88
6.1.2	Paradigm Shift.....	88
6.2	The “Black Box”	88
6.2.1	Process Plants and Facilities	88
6.2.2	Energy Storage Projects	88
6.3	Cost Metrics for BESS.....	89
6.3.1	Cost per kW.....	90
6.3.2	Cost per kWh.....	91
6.4	LCOS.....	92
6.4.1	Calculation for LCOS.....	92
6.4.2	LCOS Driven by End-Use Applications.....	92

6.4.3	LCOS for Flow Batteries.....	94
6.5	Detailed Total Installed Cost	96
6.5.1	Costs and Performance Metrics.....	96
6.5.2	Costs and Performance Data.....	99
6.5.3	Annualized Costs	102
6.6	Conclusions.....	105
7	Case Studies	106
7.1	Introduction.....	106
7.2	Nexant Case Studies.....	106
7.2.1	Case Study 1: Solar PV plus Energy Storage - Technology Campus	106
7.2.2	Case Study 2: Solar PV plus Energy Storage - Utility.....	115
7.3	Industry-Wide Case Studies.....	122
7.3.1	Case Study 3: Lausanne Polytechnic School-Martigny	123
7.3.2	Case Study 4: Flathead Electric ViZn Z20	124
7.3.3	Case Study 5: Multinational Telecommunications Company - Imergy	125
7.3.4	Case Study 6: BlueSky Energy Microgrid ViZn Z20	126
7.3.5	Case Study 7: Ergon Energy - RedFlow	127
7.3.6	Case Study 8: Minami Hayakita Substation Hokkaido Electric Power - Sumitomo	128
7.3.7	Case Study 9: Imergy Trojane Project	129
7.3.8	Case Study 10: Ontario IESO - SunEdison/Imergy Flow Battery	130
7.4	Conclusions.....	131
8	Glossary	132

Appendices

A	References	135
B	TECH Program Title Index (2009 - 2019)	139

Figures

Figure 1	Typical Captive BESS Applications	2
Figure 2	Recommended Roadmap for Large-Scale Energy Storage.....	3
Figure 3	Global BESS Market and Key Elements	5
Figure 4	Cost Metrics for BESS	6
Figure 5	Daily Demand Profile of Technology Campus.....	7
Figure 6	Profile of Energy Demand with Impact of Storage	12
Figure 7	Main Classifications of Energy Storage Technologies	13
Figure 8	Wide Range of Energy Storage Technologies	14
Figure 9	Maturity of Energy Storage Technologies	16
Figure 10	Typical Captive BESS Applications	17
Figure 11	Key Modules for Undertaking Specific Large-Scale Energy Storage Projects.....	19
Figure 12	Power Requirements versus Discharge Duration	24
Figure 13	Recommended Roadmap for Large-Scale Energy Storage.....	26
Figure 14	Energy Storage Applications	34
Figure 15	Energy Storage Technology Comparison by Average Discharge Time and Cost	35
Figure 16	Unsubsidized Levelized Costs for Flow Battery Technologies.....	35
Figure 17	Capital Cost Outlook by Technology	36
Figure 18	Illustration of a VRB Operation	40
Figure 19	V ₂ O ₅ Vanadium Pentoxide Flake 98 Percent	42
Figure 20	Vanadium Price from 2000 to 2019	42
Figure 21	Avalon Flow Batteries in a Santa Cruz Microgrid	45
Figure 22	EnerFLOW 430 Internal Structure	52
Figure 23	Z20 Unit – 20-foot Shipment Container	54
Figure 24	EnergyPod 2 Grouping	58
Figure 25	Primus Power EnergyPod Suggested Applications.....	58
Figure 26	ESS LCOS Competitive Comparison	60
Figure 27	Ammonium-enhanced Ferrocyanide-Viologen Flow Battery	62
Figure 28	Exploded view of Aquion Battery System.....	65
Figure 29	Global BESS Market and Key Elements	68
Figure 30	Typical Large-Scale BESS Installation.....	69
Figure 31	Global Energy Storage Mix Growth	70
Figure 32	United States Energy Storage Mix Growth.....	71
Figure 33	Global Battery Energy Storage Growth To-Date	73
Figure 34	Total Aggregate Operational Capacity	73
Figure 35	U.S. Battery Energy Storage Growth To-Date	74
Figure 36	Global Forecast of Aggregate Energy Storage Capacity	74
Figure 37	Cost Metrics for BESS.....	89
Figure 38	Main Cost Elements of Large-Scale BESS	90
Figure 39	Cost Components of BESS Using Water Tank Analogy	91
Figure 40	Formula for LCOS	92
Figure 41	End-Use Applications for BESS	93

Figure 42	LCOS of Four Storage Options for Secondary Response	96
Figure 43	Degradation Related Reduction in RTE	98
Figure 44	Open Circuit Voltage	98
Figure 45	Annualized Cost Values on \$/kWh-year Basis	104
Figure 46	Annualized Cost Values on \$/kWh-year Basis	104
Figure 47	BTM Energy Storage at Technology Campus.....	106
Figure 48	Daily Demand Profile of Technology Campus.....	107
Figure 49	Utility Bill Overview for the Technology Campus.....	109
Figure 50	Forecasted Results and System Specifications	109
Figure 51	Annual Electricity Costs via Current Electricity Billing	110
Figure 52	Annual Electricity Costs via New Electricity Billing	111
Figure 53	Annual Demand Profile of Electricity Supply via Grid versus Solar PV plus Energy Storage	113
Figure 54	Detailed Profile of Electricity Production, Loads, and Storage	113
Figure 55	Load Profile of Time-of-Day versus System Demand	116
Figure 56	Schematic of Single Integrated Solar PV Plus Energy Storage Facility.....	118
Figure 57	Forecasted Daily Ancillary Services Offerings	119
Figure 58	Forecasted Revenue from Daily Ancillary Services	119
Figure 59	Forecasted Prices of Daily Ancillary Prices.....	119
Figure 60	Forecasted Daily Electric Power Production and State of Charge.....	120
Figure 61	Forecasted Daily Revenue via Energy Arbitrage and Energy Regulation Services.....	120
Figure 62	Cumulative Cash Flow Profile	122

Tables

Table 1	Lausanne Polytechnic School-Martigny	7
Table 2	Comparison of Battery Energy Storage Technologies with Duration	15
Table 3	Summary of Potential Technology Impacts	30
Table 4	Comparison of Energy Storage Systems Capacities and Discharge Times	33
Table 5	Properties of Vanadium, Iron, and Zinc-based Flow Batteries	37
Table 6	Technology Comparison of Potential Batteries for Utility Applications	38
Table 7	Lithium-ion Battery Materials	38
Table 8	Vanadium Redox Flow Battery Strengths and Weaknesses	43
Table 9	EnerFLOW 430 Specifications	52
Table 10	Zinc Bromide Battery Strengths and Weaknesses	57
Table 11	Polysulfide Bromide Battery Strengths and Weaknesses	64
Table 12	Annual Battery Energy Storage Capacity Installations and Overall Market Size	72
Table 13	SWOT Analysis of Energy Storage Markets Integrating with Renewables	72
Table 14	Summary of Key Topics Addressed by Legislators and Regulators	76
Table 15	Mandates and Incentives in Key States	80
Table 16	Electricity Storage Technologies and Potential Applications	95
Table 17	Cycle, Lifespan, and RTE	100
Table 18	Estimated Degradation of RTE	100
Table 19	Summary of Cost and Performance Data	101
Table 20	Key Proforma Assumptions	102
Table 21	Summary of Key Inputs	103
Table 22	Feasibility Results for Technology Campus	108
Table 23	Summary of Annual Electricity Costs via Grid Supply	110
Table 24	Detailed Break-Down on Monthly Basis	112
Table 25	Annual Cash Flow Analysis	114
Table 26	Main Advantages of Solar PV plus Energy Storage	114
Table 27	Key Evaluations and Assessments	116
Table 28	Summary of Feasibility Study Results	117
Table 29	Cash Flow Analysis	121
Table 30	Lausanne Polytechnic School-Martigny	123
Table 31	Flathead Electric ViZn Z20	124
Table 32	Multinational Telecommunications Company - Imergy	125
Table 33	BlueSky Energy Microgrid ViZn Z20	126
Table 34	Ergon Energy - RedFlow	127
Table 35	Minami Hayakita Substation Hokkaido Electric Power - Sumitomo	128
Table 36	Imergy Trojane Project	129
Table 37	Ontario IESO - SunEdison/Imergy Flow Battery	130

Nexant Inc.

TECHNOLOGY & COSTS

Technoeconomics - Energy & Chemicals (TECH)

The Nexant Subscriptions' Technoeconomics - Energy & Chemicals (TECH) program is recognized globally as the industry standard source for information relevant to the chemical process and refining industries. Technoeconomics - Energy & Chemicals (TECH) reports are available as a subscription program or on a single report basis.

Contact Details:

Americas:

Marcos Nogueira Cesar, Vice President, Global Products, E&CA: Nexant Subscriptions

Phone: + 1-914-609-0324, e-mail: mcesar@nexant.com

Erica Hill, Client Services Coordinator, E&CA-Products

Phone: + 1-914-609-0386, e-mail: ehill@nexant.com

EMEA:

Anna Ibbotson, Director, Nexant Subscriptions

Phone: +44-207-950-1528, aibbotson@nexant.com

Asia:

Chommanad Thammanayakatip, Managing Consultant, Energy & Chemicals Advisory

Phone: +66-2793-4606, email: chommanadt@nexant.com

Nexant, Inc. (www.nexant.com) is a leading management consultancy to the global energy, chemical, and related industries. For over 38 years, Nexant has helped clients increase business value through assistance in all aspects of business strategy, including business intelligence, project feasibility and implementation, operational improvement, portfolio planning, and growth through M&A activities. Nexant has its main offices in San Francisco (California), White Plains (New York), and London (UK), and satellite offices worldwide.

Copyright © by Nexant Inc. 2018. All Rights Reserved.