

Biorenewable Insights Carbon Dioxide to Chemicals and Fuels

Table of Contents

A Report by NexantThinking™

Published October 2017

www.nexantthinking.com

Section	Page
1 Executive Summary	1
1.1 OVERVIEW	1
1.2 TECHNOLOGIES	3
1.3 ECONOMICS	4
1.3.1 USGC	6
1.3.2 South America	8
1.3.3 Western Europe	8
1.3.4 Asia	9
1.4 CARBON DIOXIDE UTILIZATION AND END OF LIFE	11
1.4.1 Overview	11
1.4.2 Global Analysis	11
2 Introduction	17
2.1 SEGMENTATION OF SOURCES	18
2.2 DISPOSITION OF CARBON DIOXIDE	18
2.3 PRODUCTS FROM CARBON DIOXIDE	19
2.3.1 Existing Uses	20
3 Technologies	23
3.1 ORGANIC CARBONATES	23
3.1.1 Ethylene Carbonate	23
3.1.2 Dimethyl Carbonate	25
3.1.3 Polycarbonates	28

3.1.4	Key Players.....	36
3.2	DRY REFORMING AND SYNGAS	38
3.2.1	Key Players.....	44
3.3	UREA	44
3.3.1	Key Players.....	47
3.4	METHANOL	49
3.4.1	Key Players.....	55
3.5	SODA ASH.....	55
3.6	BIOTECHNOLOGY FEEDSTOCK	59
3.6.1	Succinic Acid.....	60
3.6.2	Algae Technology	85
3.6.3	Syngas Fermentations	135
3.7	ELECTROCHEMICAL CONVERSION OF CO ₂	149
3.7.1	Formic Acid.....	149
3.7.2	DMC	153
3.7.3	Liquid Light/Avantium	154
3.7.4	Others.....	156
3.8	CEMENT	156
3.8.1	Calera.....	156
3.8.2	Carbon Sense Solutions.....	160
3.8.3	Novacem.....	160
3.8.4	Other Minor Players	161
3.8.5	Key Players.....	161
3.9	OTHER USES	162
3.9.1	Salicylic Acid.....	162
3.9.2	CO ₂ as a Solvent	164
3.9.3	Other.....	165
4	Economics	168
4.1	METHODOLOGY	168
4.1.1	Operating Cost Elements	168
4.2	PRICES.....	170
4.3	COMPARISON OF CAPEX	171
4.4	COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS BY REGION	171
4.4.1	USGC	173
4.4.2	South America	178

4.4.3	Western Europe	183
4.4.4	Asia	187
4.5	COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS BY PROCESS.....	191
5	CO ₂ Utilization and End of Life	197
5.1	OVERVIEW	197
5.2	GLOBAL ANALYSIS.....	197
5.2.1	CO ₂ Utilization Potential	197
5.2.2	CO ₂ End of Life Potential.....	200
5.3	NORTH AMERICAN ANALYSIS	203
5.3.1	CO ₂ Utilization Potential	203
5.3.2	CO ₂ End of Life Potential.....	203
5.4	SOUTH AMERICAN ANALYSIS	205
5.4.1	CO ₂ Utilization Potential	205
5.4.2	CO ₂ End of Life Potential.....	206
5.5	WESTERN EUROPE ANALYSIS.....	207
5.5.1	CO ₂ Utilization Potential	207
5.5.2	CO ₂ End of Life Potential.....	208
5.6	ASIA ANALYSIS	209
5.6.1	CO ₂ Utilization Potential	209
5.6.2	CO ₂ End of Life Potential.....	210
6	References	211

Figure	Page
1.1 Carbon Stabilization Wedges	2
1.2 USGC Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency.....	7
1.3 Brazil Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency	8
1.4 Western Europe Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency.....	9
1.5 China Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency.....	10
1.6 World CO ₂ Utilization Potential, Composite Model	12
1.7 World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less, Composite Model ...	12
1.8 World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits US\$0 to US\$100, Composite Model	13
1.9 World CO ₂ Utilization Potential, World Leader Model	13
1.10 World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits less than US\$100, World Leader Model.....	14
1.11 World CO ₂ End of Life Potential, Composite Model.....	14
1.12 World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less, Composite Model ...	15
1.13 World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits US\$0 to US\$100, Composite Model	15
1.14 World CO ₂ End of Life Potential, World Leader Model	16
1.15 World CO ₂ End of Life Potential for Carbon Credits less than US\$100, World Leader Model.....	16
2.1 Carbon Stabilization Wedges	17
3.1 Ethylene Carbonate Production.....	24
3.2 Asahi Kasei Ethylene Carbonate Transesterification with Methanol.....	27
3.3 Asahi Kasei/Chi Mei Melt Polycarbonate Process	31
3.4 Conventional Steam Methane Reforming	40
3.5 Block Flow Diagram for Combined CO ₂ and Steam Methane Reforming	41
3.6 Sandia's CR5	43
3.7 Urea Yield as a Function of NH ₃ /CO ₂ Ratio.....	46
3.8 Conversion of Carbon Dioxide to Urea at Different Temperatures	46
3.9 Snamprogetti Ammonia Stripping Process for Urea	48
3.10 Bench Scale 50 kg per day Methanol Synthesis Plant.....	51
3.11 Electrolytic Methanol Synthesis	53
3.12 Solvay Process Block Flow Diagram	57
3.13 Refined Sodium Bicarbonate Process Flow Diagram	58
3.14 Cell Metabolic Carbon Balance.....	59

3.15 Major Metabolic Pathways in a Typical Cell	62
3.16 Central Glucose Metabolic Pathway in a Typical Cell.....	63
3.17 Anaerobic Degradation of Pyruvate	65
3.18 Glyoxylate and TCA Cycles	66
3.19 Oxidative and Reductive TCA Branches	67
3.20 Calculations for Maximum Anaerobic Theoretical Yield from Glucose	69
3.21 Calculations for Maximum Theoretical Combined Pathway Yield from Glucose	70
3.22 Calculations for Maximum Oxidative and Reductive Theoretical Yield from Glucose	71
3.23 BioAmber Plant in Sarnia, Canada	73
3.24 BioAmber Fermentation Process Flow Diagram.....	77
3.25 BioAmber Succinic Acid Purification Flow Diagram	78
3.26 Succinity Semi-commercial Plant in Montmelo, Spain	79
3.27 Succinity's Assumed Pathways to Biosuccinic Acid	80
3.28 Succinity Fermentation Simple Flow Diagram	83
3.29 Succinity Purification Simple Flow Diagram	84
3.30 Photosynthesis in Algae	91
3.31 PAR Wavelengths	92
3.32 Photosynthetic Efficiency of Algae	93
3.33 Light Penetration in Water of the Absorbable Spectrum	94
3.34 Optical Density Photo-Inhibition.....	94
3.35 Metabolic Pathways	96
3.36 Micrographs of Algae before (Left) and After (Right) Oil Accumulation	96
3.37 Scripps Research Institute's Proposed Algae System	100
3.38 Raceway Algae Pond Diagram	102
3.39 Raceway Algae Pond	102
3.40 Round Pond	103
3.41 Some Microalgae Species Currently in Commercial Production	103
3.42 Selected Open Pond Algae Projects Currently in Operation.....	104
3.43 Some of the Different Types of Closed Systems for Algal Cultivation	105
3.44 Solix's Closed System for Algae Cultivation	105
3.45 NASA's "Open-Ocean" Photobioreactors.....	106
3.46 Solazyme/TerraVia's Lab-Scale Fermenter.....	107
3.47 Metabolic Pathway Used Heterotrophic Algae Growth Systems	108
3.48 Algae's Role in Ocean Dead Zones	109
3.49 Algae Removal in China.....	110

3.50 Overlay of Global Stationary Sources of CO ₂ Emissions and Net Surface Solar Radiation	111
3.51 Distribution of Stationary Sources of Carbon Dioxide	114
3.52 Electric Power Plant Location Relative to Average Annual Solar Hours Received	115
3.53 JAXA Analysis of Global CO ₂ Emissions.....	116
3.54 Algae Oil Production Options.....	119
3.55 Algae Oil Energy Requirements.....	119
3.56 Auto-Flocculation of Algae.....	120
3.57 AlgaeVenture Systems Harvester	121
3.58 Algae Dried Using AlgaeVenture Systems Harvester	122
3.59 Lysis in Algae.....	123
3.60 Diagram of an Oil Expeller.....	124
3.61 Algae Oil Separation via Ultrasonics.....	124
3.62 Origin Oil's Extraction Process	125
3.63 Sponge-Like Nanoparticles for Algal Oil Extraction	125
3.64 Tilapia.....	127
3.65 Brine Shrimp and Algae.....	127
3.66 Sapphire Energy's Process Overview.....	131
3.67 Reductive Acetyl-CoA Pathway	137
3.68 300-Ton Pre-commercial Plant at Baosteel Mill near Shanghai	139
3.69 LanzaTech's Product Platform.....	140
3.70 Indian River County Bioenergy Center.....	143
3.71 Kiverdi Reactor Design.....	147
3.72 Two Possible Kiverdi Reactor Process Configurations	148
3.73 Representative Schematic of ECFORM Reactor.....	150
3.74 Mantra ERC System.....	151
3.75 Representation of a Flow through Photocatalyst Array.....	153
3.76 Block Flow Diagram for Liquid Light's CO ₂ to Chemicals – Electrochemical Cell	154
3.77 Block Flow Diagram for Liquid Light's CO ₂ to Chemicals – Second Reactor	155
3.78 Calera "Cement" Production Pilot Plant	157
3.79 Solubility of Carbon Dioxide in Water at Different Pressures/Temperatures.....	158
3.80 CO ₂ Speciation and Solubility at 25 °C and P(CO ₂) 0.1 MPa with a Total Carbon(IV) Activity = 1	159
3.81 Simplified Salicylic Acid Production by Kolbe-Schmitt Method.....	163
3.82 Pressure –Temperature Diagram of Carbon Dioxide Illustrating the Critical Point.....	165
3.83 Ammonium Sulfate and Calcium Carbonate Production Process Flow Diagram	166

4.1	CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels - USGC Economic Competitiveness.....	173
4.2	USGC Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency.....	175
4.3	USGC Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency, Excluding Liquid Light and Cement.....	175
4.4	USGC Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency for Technologies with Positive Returns	176
4.5	CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels Brazil Economic Competitiveness	178
4.6	Brazil Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency	180
4.7	Brazil Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency, Excluding Liquid Light and Cement.....	180
4.8	Brazil Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency for Technologies with Positive Returns	181
4.9	CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels Western Europe Economic Competitiveness.....	183
4.10	Western Europe Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency.....	185
4.11	Western Europe Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency, Excluding Liquid Light and Cement.....	185
4.12	Western Europe Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency for Technologies with Positive Returns	186
4.13	CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels China Economic Competitiveness.....	187
4.14	China Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency.....	189
4.15	China Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and Showing Capital Efficiency for Technologies with Positive Returns	189
4.16	Urea via Biogas Comparative Economics by Region.....	192
4.17	Methanol via Biogas Comparative Economics by Region.....	192
4.18	Succinic Acid Comparative Economics by Region	193
4.19	Open Pond Algae Oil Comparative Economics by Region	193
4.20	PBR Algae Oil Comparative Economics by Region.....	193
4.21	Heterotrophic Algae Oil Comparative Economics by Region	194
4.22	Syngas Fermentation to Ethanol Comparative Economics by Region	194
4.23	Liquid Light MEG Comparative Economics by Region	194
4.24	Corn Ethanol Comparative Economics by Region.....	195
4.25	Sugarcane Ethanol Comparative Economics by Region	195
4.26	Ethanol to MEG Comparative Economics by Region.....	195
4.27	Ethylene Carbonate Comparative Economics by Region	196
4.28	Cement Comparative Economics by Region.....	196
5.1	World CO ₂ Utilization Potential, Composite Model	198

5.2	World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less, Composite Model ...	198
5.3	World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits US\$0 to US\$100, Composite Model	199
5.4	World CO ₂ Utilization Potential, World Leader Model	199
5.5	World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits less than US\$100, World Leader Model	200
5.6	World CO ₂ End of Life Potential, Composite Model	200
5.7	World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less, Composite Model ...	201
5.8	World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits US\$0 to US\$100, Composite Model	201
5.9	World CO ₂ End of Life Potential, World Leader Model	202
5.10	World CO ₂ End of Life Potential for Carbon Credits less than US\$100, World Leader Model	202
5.11	North America CO ₂ Utilization Potential	203
5.12	North America CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits Less than US\$100	203
5.13	North America CO ₂ End of Life Potential	204
5.14	North American End of Life Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less	204
5.15	South America CO ₂ Utilization Potential	205
5.16	South America CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits Less than US\$100	205
5.17	South America CO ₂ End of Life Potential	206
5.18	South American End of Life Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or Less	206
5.19	Western Europe CO ₂ Utilization Potential	207
5.20	Western Europe CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits Less than US\$100	207
5.21	Western Europe CO ₂ End of Life Potential	208
5.22	Western Europe End of Life Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less	208
5.23	Asia CO ₂ Utilization Potential	209
5.24	Asian CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits Less than US\$100	209
5.25	Asian CO ₂ End of Life Potential	210
5.26	Asian End of Life Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less	210

Table	Page
1.1 Current Developers of Carbon Dioxide to Chemicals Technologies.....	3
1.2 USGC Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE).....	7
1.3 Brazil Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE)	8
1.4 Western Europe Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE).....	9
1.5 China Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE).....	10
2.1 Non-Transformative Uses of Carbon Dioxide	18
2.2 Current Developers of Carbon Dioxide to Chemicals Technologies.....	19
3.1 Typical Characteristic Syngas Composition	38
3.2 Glycolysis and TCA Cycle: Successive Enzymatic Reactions	64
3.3 Ethanolic and Lactic Fermentation Reactions	65
3.4 Glyoxylate Cycle Reactions	66
3.5 Highest Yields Reported for the Selected Microorganisms	72
3.6 Algae Industry Status of Development.....	87
3.7 Algae Industry Supporters Status of Development.....	89
3.8 Composition of Selected Microalgae.....	98
3.9 Oil Yield and Oil Content of Various Biomass Feedstocks.....	112
3.10 Profile of Global Stationary CO ₂ Sources (< 0.1 TPA CO ₂).....	113
3.11 Profile of U.S. CO ₂ Emissions from Stationary Sources	114
3.12 Cell Densities of Heterotrophic Algae for PUFAs (<u>P</u> oly <u>u</u> nsaturated <u>F</u> atty <u>A</u> cids)	120
3.13 Algae Harvesting Options.....	121
3.14 Common Algae Drying Schemes	122
3.15 Biochemical Carbon Fixation Pathways	136
3.16 Theoretical Yields of Ethanol Production Using Reductive Acetyl-CoA Pathway.....	138
3.17 Non-Transformative Uses of Carbon Dioxide	167
4.1 Prices for Main Feedstock, Byproduct, and Utilities Inputs to Models	170
4.2 CAPEX Comparison Table	171
4.3 CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels USGC Economic Competitiveness.....	174
4.4 USGC Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE).....	174
4.5 CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels Brazil Economic Competitiveness	178
4.6 Brazil Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE)	179
4.7 CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels Western Europe Economic Competitiveness.....	183
4.8 Western Europe Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE).....	184
4.9 CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels China Economic Competitiveness.....	188
4.10 China Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE).....	188

NexantThinking™

Biorenewable Insights



Nexant, Inc. (www.nexantthinking.com) is a leading management consultancy to the global energy, chemical, and related industries. For over 38 years, Nexant has helped clients increase business value through assistance in all aspects of business strategy, including business intelligence, project feasibility and implementation, operational improvement, portfolio planning, and growth through M&A activities. Nexant has its main offices in San Francisco (California), White Plains (New York), and London (UK), and satellite offices worldwide.

Contact Details:

New York: Steven Slome

Phone: + 1-914-609-0379, e-mail: sslome@nexant.com

Erica Hill, Client Services Coordinator, E&CA-Products

Phone: + 1-914-609-0386, e-mail: ehill@nexant.com

Nexant, Inc. (www.nexant.com) is a leading management consultancy to the global energy, chemical, and related industries. For over 38 years, Nexant has helped clients increase business value through assistance in all aspects of business strategy, including business intelligence, project feasibility and implementation, operational improvement, portfolio planning, and growth through M&A activities. Nexant has its main offices in San Francisco (California), White Plains (New York), and London (UK), and satellite offices worldwide.

Copyright © by Nexant Inc. 2018. All Rights Reserved.